Learning From Transitions

Who’s Learning from Whom?

Workshop sponsored by The Harriman Institute, Columbia University

International Affairs Building, Room 1512

Friday, September 18th

9:00am – Introduction

Session 1 9:15am – 10:15am

Ivan Krastev: Varieties of Imitation
Discussant: David Stark

10:15am – 10:30am: Coffee Break

Session 2 10:30am - 12:01pm

Valerie Bunce: Authoritarian Regimes and International Learning: The Russian Invasion of Ukraine
Jeffrey Wasserstrom: Chinese Dreams and Chinese Nightmares, 1895-2015

12:15pm – 1:15pm: Lunch for invited participants

Session 3 1:15pm – 3:00pm

Laszlo Bruszt: EU Learning During the Eastern Enlargement: What, How, and Why So Little?
Jan-Werner Mueller: Europe’s Other Democracy Problem
Discussant: Katarina Pistor

3:00pm – 3:30 pm: Coffee Break

Session 4 3:30pm – 4:30pm

Balint Magyar: The Hungarian Post-Communist Mafia State
Discussant: Vadim Radaev

4:30 – 4:45pm Coffee Break
Session 5 4:45pm-6:30pm

Jonathan Bach: Rebranding the Bastard: 'Making' as a New Business Model in Shenzhen
Oleg Kharkhordin: Are We Doomed to Creativity? Cultural Characteristics of Technological Entrepreneurship in Post-Soviet Russia
Discussant: Elena Krumova

Saturday, September 19th

Session 6 8:45am – 11:45am

Janos Kovacs: Traces in the Sand. Post-Communist Transformation and Economic Thought in the West
Gerard Roland: The Big Bang Gradualism Debate Revisited and the Nature of Post Socialist Transformation
Juliet Johnson: Postcommunist Central Banks: Who Is Learning from the Global Financial Crisis?
Discussant: Satoshi Mizobata

11:45 – 12:00 Coffee Break

Session 7 12:00pm – 1:15pm

Barbara Stallings: Traveling Strategies for Development
Al Stepan: Religion and Democracy
WORKSHOP PRESENTERS

Jonathan Bach

[Image]

Jonathan Bach is Chair of the interdisciplinary Global Studies undergraduate program and Associate Professor of International Affairs at The New School in New York. His current work concerns post-socialist transition in Germany and China and how these societies appropriate their past. Bach draws from anthropology, sociology and political science to explore how received notions of sovereignty, space and identity are reformulated through micro-level practices. He has also written on information technology and organizational change, labor migration and citizenship, and political theory. Bach is the author of Between Sovereignty and Integration: German Foreign Policy and National Identity after 1989 (St. Martin’s Press 1999), and his articles have appeared in Cultural Anthropology, Cultural Politics, Public Culture, Theory, Culture and Society, Cultural Politics, Studies in Comparative and International Development, Geopolitics, and Philosophy and Social Science.

Laszlo Bruszt

[Image]

Prof. Bruszt has a Ph.D. in Sociology from the Hungarian Academy of Sciences. Since 1992 he has been successively associate professor and professor at the Department of Political Sciences at the Central European University. Currently, he is Professor of Sociology at the European University Institute. He has taught in the United States at Notre Dame University, at the New School for Social Research and at Cornell University. He has been a research fellow at the EUI in 1987/88, and a visiting fellow at the Wissenschaftskolleg in Berlin, at the Budapest Collegium and at the Center for Advanced Study in Behavioral Sciences at Stanford. In his earlier research he has dealt with issues of democratization and the interplay between economic and political transformation in the postcommunist countries. His more recent studies deal with the interplay between transnationalization, institutional development and economic change. Focusing on the the economic integration of the Eastern peripheries of Europe, in his latest research he explores the different strategies used by EU to impose its policies and rules on Central and Eastern European countries. His research with Gerald McDermott on transnational integration regimes deals with inter-regional comparison of the different strategies of transnational regulatory integration and development. With the support of the Global Governance Programme at EUI and the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) Bruszt and McDermott launched a research initiative to explore the formation of Transnational Integration Regimes (TIRs). The result of this project are forthcoming in 2014 at Oxford University Press in volume co-edited by Bruszt and McDermott.
Valerie Bunce

Valerie Bunce is Professor of Government and the Aaron Binenkorb Chair of International Studies at Cornell University. Her primary field is comparative politics and, secondarily, international relations. Her research and teaching address comparative democratization, international democracy promotion (primarily by the U.S.); and inter-ethnic cooperation and conflict. Her most recent book (with Sharon Wolchik) is *Defeating Authoritarian Leaders in Postcommunist Countries* (Cambridge University Press, 2011).

Juliet Johnson

Juliet Johnson is Professor of Political Science at McGill University. Her research focuses primarily on money and banking in the post-communist world, as well as on post-communist memory politics. She is the author of *Priests of Prosperity: Transnational Central Bankers and Post-Communist Transformation* (forthcoming, Cornell University Press) and *A Fistful of Rubles: The Rise and Fall of the Russian Banking System* (Cornell 2000); co-editor of *Religion and Identity in Modern Russia: The Revival of Orthodoxy and Islam* (Ashgate 2005); and author of articles in *Europe-Asia Studies, Post-Soviet Affairs, Problems of Post-Communism, Journal of Common Market Studies, Comparative Politics, Journal of European Public Policy, the Annals of the Association of American Geographers, Social and Cultural Geography*, and *Review of International Political Economy (RIPE)*, among others. She was Lead Editor of RIPE from 2011-14 and Co-Editor from 2007-10. She has served as an Advisory Council member for the Kennan Institute, a Research Fellow in Foreign Policy Studies at the Brookings Institution, and a National Fellow at the Hoover Institution. At McGill, she is an elected member of the McGill Board of Governors, has served as Associate Dean (Research and Graduate Studies) for the Faculty of Arts, and won the Faculty’s Fieldhouse award for Distinguished Teaching. She received her PhD and MA in Politics from Princeton University and her AB in International Relations from Stanford University.

Oleg Kharkhordin

Prof. Kharkhordin graduated from the Economics Department of Leningrad University, and then studied in the doctoral program of the University California, Berkeley (PhD, political science, 1996). He then held a postdoc at the Harvard Academy for International and Area Studies (1996-1998), and over the years has taught extensively as a Visiting Professor in the US (e.g. Yale, Political Science (Spring 2002) and Harvard, Government (2002-2003)) and in France at Sciences Po, Paris (2005, 2006, 2008). His main teaching position since the late 1990s was at the Department of Political science and Sociology at the European U at St. Petersburg where he was teaching classes on political theory and on the sociology of everyday life. As chair of the Department, he started IMARS (International MA in Russian Studies), a novel program for
graduate students from Western Europe and North America. He served as Vice-Rector for Development at EUSP since 2005, where he was actively involved in creating the EUSP Fund. The Fund, which is the second university endowment to be registered in Russia (2007), has since then ranked among the top three Russian university endowments in size. Elected Rector in 2009, Prof. Kharkhordin has become the first Russian university president with a US PhD degree. He has been a member of the Russian Presidential Council for Science and Education since 2012.

Ivan Krastev

Ivan Krastev is the Chairman of the Centre for Liberal Strategies in Sofia, Permanent fellow at the Institute for Human Sciences in Vienna. He is a founding board member of the European Council on Foreign Relations. His books in English are "Democracy Disrupted. The Global Politics on Protest" (UPenn Press, May 2014); "In Mistrust We Trust: Can Democracy Survive When We Don't Trust Our Leaders?" (TED Books, 2013); "The Anti-American Century", co-edited with Alan McPherson, (CEU Press, 2007) and "Shifting Obsessions: Three Essays on the Politics of Anticorruption" (CEU Press, 2004). He is a co-author with Stephen Holmes of a forthcoming book on Russian politics.

Janos Kovacs

János Kovács graduated at the Karl Marx University of Economics, Budapest in 1973. He defended his doctoral dissertation on “The Market Economy of the NEP” at the same university in 1975. In 1973, he became a research fellow at the Institute of Economics, Hungarian Academy of Sciences, Budapest. Since 1984, he has taught history of economic thought as well as political economy of communism and the post-communist transformation at various departments of Eötvös Loránd University and Karl Marx University of Economics (today: Corvinus University) in Budapest. In 1987, Kovacs moved to Vienna, and has worked as a Permanent Fellow at the IWM since 1991, while remaining an external research fellow of the Institute of Economics in Budapest until 2014. Since 2009, he has taught history of economic thought at the Department of Economics, Eötvös Loránd University again. He serves as an editor of Transit (Vienna) and 2000 (Budapest).

Balint Magyar

Dr. Magyar started his career as a researcher (1977-1990) at different research institutes. Between 1979 and 1990 he was a human right activist of the anti-communist opposition movement. Since its foundation in 1988 until 2009 he was one of the leaders of the Hungarian Liberal Party (Alliance of Free Democrats). Between 1988 and 1990 he took part in architecting the new democracy and negotiating about the peaceful transition. As a Minister of Education he initiated and carried out public and higher education reform
process. He was Vice President of the National Development Council under the direction of the Prime Minister (2006-2008) and Secretary of State for Development Policy (2007-2008). As a State Secretary responsible for EU Funds, he launched and carried out huge projects in education and culture. Dr. Magyar was a member of the Governing Board of the European Institute of Innovation and Technology (EIT) (2008-2012). He is one of the founders and board members of the international NGO, Empowering European Universities. Since 2010 he has been engaged by Unicef, Open Society Foundation and European Roma Right Center in different missions as a consultant to enhance education reforms in some countries of East Europe (Republic of Moldova, Bulgaria, Macedonia, Romania, Czech Republic). Currently he is a researcher and strategic consultant of the Financial Research Plc. at Budapest

**Jan-Werner Mueller**

Jan-Werner Mueller is a Professor of Politics at Princeton University where he directs the Project in the History of Political Thought at the University Center for Human Values. His research interests include the history of modern political thought, liberalism and its critics, constitutionalism, religion and politics, and the normative dimensions of European integration. He is the author of *Constitutional Patriotism* (Princeton UP, 2007; German, Chinese, Turkish, Korean, Japanese, and Serbian translations), *A Dangerous Mind: Carl Schmitt in Post-War European Thought* (Yale University Press, 2003; German, French, Japanese, Greek, Serbian, and Chinese translations) and *Another Country: German Intellectuals, Unification and National Identity* (Yale University Press, 2000; Chinese translation). In addition, he has edited *German Ideologies since 1945: Studies in the Political Thought and Culture of the Bonn Republic* (Palgrave, 2003) and *Memory and Power in Post-War Europe: Studies in the Presence of the Past* (Cambridge UP, 2002). In 2011 Yale University Press published *Contesting Democracy: Political Ideas in Twentieth Century Europe*. (German, French, Italian, Russian, Chinese, Polish, and Serbian translations). Professor Mueller has been a fellow at All Souls College, Oxford, the Collegium Budapest Institute for Advanced Study, the Helsinki Collegium for Advanced Studies, the Center for European Studies, Harvard University, the Remarque Institute, NYU, and the European University Institute, Florence; he has also been a Member of the Institute of Advanced Study Princeton. He has taught as a visiting professor at the EHESS, Paris, and Sciences Po, Paris. In 2011 he delivered the Carlyle Lectures in the History of Political Thought at Oxford University. He is a fellow of the Royal Historical Society.

**Gerard Roland**

Gerard Roland is the E. Morris Cox Professor of Economics and Professor of Political Science at the University of California, Berkeley. He received his PhD from Universite Libre de Bruxelles in 1988 and taught there from 1988-2001. Professor Roland is also a CEPR research fellow, where he was program director between 1995 and 2006. He serves as editor of the Journal of Comparative Economics, and was an associate editor for several other journals. Among Professor Roland’s awards and honors are recipient of the Medal of the University of Helsinki, Officier de l’Ordre de Leopold II, and entry in "Who's Who in the World," "Who's Who in America," and Who's Who in
Economics since 1776." He was a fellow at the Center for Advanced Studies in Behavioral Sciences in Stanford in 1998-1999. He was program chair of the Fifth Nobel symposium in Economics devoted to the Economics of Transition in 1999. He was named Jean Monnet Professor at Université Libre de Bruxelles in 2001 and received an Honorary Professorship of Renmin University of China in 2002.

**Barbara Stallings**

Barbara Stallings is the William R. Rhodes Research Professor at the Watson Institute, co-director of Brown's Graduate Program in Development, and editor of *Studies in Comparative International Development*. She is past director of the Institute and of its Political Economy and Development Program. Stallings has a PhD in economics from Cambridge University and a PhD in political science from Stanford University. Prior to joining the Institute in 2002, she was director of the Economic Development Division of the United Nations Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean in Santiago, Chile, and professor of political science at the University of Wisconsin-Madison. She is author or editor of 12 books and numerous book chapters and articles. She has served on the editorial boards of *Studies in Comparative International Development*, *Oxford Development Studies*, *Oxford Companion to Politics of the World*, *International Studies Quarterly*, *American Journal of Political Science*, and *Latin American Research Review*.

**Alfred Stepan**

Alfred Stepan is Wallace Sayre Professor of Government, the founding Director of the Center for the Study of Democracy, Toleration, and Religion (CDTR), and the Co-Director of the Institute for Religion, Culture, and Public Life (IRCPL). In 2012 he was the recipient of the Karl Deutsch Award of the International Political Science Association. Previously, Stepan was the founding Rector and President of Central European University in Budapest, Prague, and Warsaw, the former Director of the Concilium on International and Area Studies at Yale University, and Dean of the School of International Affairs at Columbia University. Stepan was also Gladstone Professor of Government at the University of Oxford and a Fellow Of All Souls College, Oxford. Stepan's teaching and research interests include comparative politics, theories of democratic transitions, federalism, and the world's religious systems and democracy. In recent years, Stepan has conducted field research in Indonesia, Sri Lanka, Burma, Egypt, Tunisia, India, Brazil, Israel, and Palestine, among other countries. Stepan's publications in the last three years include *Crafting State Nations: India and Other Multinational Democracies*, with Juan J. Linz and Yogendra Yadav; “Comparative Perspectives on Inequality and the Quality of Democracy in the United States” with Juan J. Linz in *Perspectives on Politics* (December 2011); “Tunisia’s Transition and the Twin Toleration” in *Journal of Democracy* (April 2012); ““Rituals of Respect: Sufis and Secularists in Senegal in Comparative Perspective” in *Comparative Politics* (July 2012) “Democratization Theory and the ‘Arab Spring’”, *Journal of Democracy* (April 2013), (with Linz), “Democratic Parliamentary Monarchies,” *Journal of Democracy* (April 2014), (with Linz and Minoves), and the co-editorship
of Democracy & Islam in Indonesia (with Mirjam Künkler), Boundaries of Toleration (with Charles Taylor), and Democracy, Islam and Secularism: Turkey in Comparative Perspective (with Ahmet Kuru). Some of his other books include Arguing Comparative Politics (Oxford 2001); Problems of Democratic Transition and Consolidation: Southern Europe, South America, and Post-Communist Europe, with J. J. Linz (Johns Hopkins 1996); Rethinking Military Politics: Brazil and the Southern Cone (Princeton 1988); The Breakdown of Democratic Regimes, edited with Juan J. Linz (Johns Hopkins 1978); The State and Society: Peru in Comparative Perspective (Princeton 1978); and The Military in Politics: Changing Patterns in Brazil (Princeton 1971).

Jeffrey Wasserstrom

Jeffrey N. Wasserstrom is a Chancellor’s Professor of History at the University of California, Irvine. He is a modern Chinese social and cultural historian, with a strong interest in connecting China’s past to its present and placing both into comparative and global perspective. Wasserstrom currently serves as the editor of the Journal of Asian Studies. Wasserstrom is the author of numerous books and articles on subjects ranging from gender to revolution, human rights to urban change. Among his books are Student Protests in the 20th Century: The View from Shanghai; China in 2008: A Year of Great Significance; Global Shanghai, 1850-2010; China’s Brave New World--And Other Tales for Global Times. Wasserstrom served as one of the editors for the Oxford University Press “Pages from History” series (the goal of which was to produce high quality, document-based books for use in introductory classes) and worked as a consultant to the talented filmmakers of the Long Bow Group, whose documentary on Tiananmen, “The Gate of Heavenly Peace,” was shown on PBS, and whose documentary on the Cultural Revolution, “Morning Sun,” won a prize from the American Historical Association. In addition, during the last decade-and-a-half, he has routinely written commentaries and reviews for general interest magazines (e.g., Time and Newsweek, The Nation, and the TLS in London), newspapers (such as the Los Angeles Times, the Wall Street Journal, the Financial Times, and the New York Times), and many online publications. He is also the Editor of the Journal of Asian Studies, the flagship publication of the Association for Asian Studies, and co-edits the Asia Section of the Los Angeles Review of Books.

DISCUSSIONS

Elena Krumova

Elena Krumova is postdoctoral fellow at the Harriman Institute at Columbia University and a Visiting Assistant Professor at the School of Public Policy at Central European University. She is an organizational sociology scholar interested in the organizational and managerial practices of public policymaking. Her research explored the work of public facilitators and network managers who are trying to introduce deliberative models of regional and urban planning in Eastern Europe. Previously, she has taught at New York University and Columbia University.
Satoshi Mizobata

Satoshi Mizobata is Associate Professor at the Kyoto Institute of Economic Research (KIER). Since 1999, he has been the Director of The Association for the Study of Comparative Economic Systems and since 2000, the Director of the Japan Association for the Comparative Studies of Management. In addition, he is the Director of the Japanese Association for Russia and East European Studies and the Japanese Society for Slavic and East European Studies. Professor Mizobata is the Editor in Chief of “Comparative Economic Studies” (Journal of the Society of Researchers on Comparative Economic Studies).

Katarina Pistor

Katharina Pistor is the Walter E. Meyer Research Professor in Law & Social Problems and the Michael I. Sovern Professor of Law at Columbia Law School. She is also the director of the Law School’s Center on Global Legal Transformation and has served as a member of Columbia University’s Committee on Global Thought since its inception. She previously taught at the Kennedy School of Government, and worked at the Max Planck Institute for Foreign and International Private Law in Hamburg, Germany and the Harvard Institute for International Development. In the 1990s she worked predominantly on transition economies in Central and Eastern Europe and Russia, where she conducted extensive field research. Since then, her research has expanded to other emerging markets (in East Asia) and the impact of globalization on the transformation of law and legal institutions in the areas of finance, property rights and transnational regulation. She is Principal Investigator of the “Global Finance and Law Initiative,” a collaborative research project aimed at re-conceptualizing the relation between finance and law, funded by INET. She is a member of the Board of Directors of the European Corporate Governance Institute, a Research Associate of the Center for Economic Policy Research and an Editor of “Economics of Transition.” In 2012 she received the Max Planck Research Award for her contributions to international financial regulation. Recent publications include “Governing Financial Interdependence: Lessons from the Vienna Initiative” (Journal of Globalization and Development, 2011); “Global Network Finance” (Journal of Comparative Economics, 2009); and with Curtis Milhaupt, “Law and Capitalism: What Corporate Crises Reveal about Legal Systems and Economic Development Around the World” (Chicago University Press 2008).

Vadim Radaev

Vadim Radaev joined the National Research University Moscow in 1999 and is currently serving as its First Vice Rector. He is the Head of Department of Economic Sociology and the Editor in Chief of the Economiceskaya Sotsiologiya (Economic Sociology) Journal. He has published nine books in Russian, including: Who Holds the Power in Consumer Markets: Retailer-Supplier Relationships in Contemporary

David Stark

David Stark is the Arthur Lehman Professor of Sociology at Columbia University where he directs the Center on Organizational Innovation. He is also Centennial Professor at the London School of Economics. His book, *The Sense of Dissonance: Accounts of Worth in Economic Life* (Princeton University Press 2011) is an ethnographic account of how organizations and their members search for what is valuable. ‘Game Changer: The Topology of Creativity,’ a recent article on cognitive diversity and network social structures, co-authored with Mathijs de Vaan and Balazs Vedres, appears in the January 2015 issue of *American Journal of Sociology (AJS)*. Other network analytic articles (co-authored with Vedres) on economic sociology appear in *AJS* (2006 and 2010) and the *American Sociological Review* (2012). Stark is the co-editor of *Moments of Valuation: Exploring Sites of Dissonance* (Oxford 2015). In the social studies of finance he has conducted ethnographic field research with Daniel Beunza, large N analysis of attention networks with Matteo Prato, and lab experimental work on ethnic diversity and market bubbles with Sheen Levine. With photographer, Nancy Warner, he recently published *This Place, These People: Life and Shadow on the Great Plains* (Columbia University Press, 2013). Among other awards, Stark is the recipient of a Guggenheim Fellowship (2002) and an Honorary Doctorate from the Ecole normale superieure de Cachan (2013). His CV, publications, papers, course materials, ‘silent lectures,’ and other presentations are available at [thesenseofdissonance.com](http://thesenseofdissonance.com).
Learning from Transitions:
Who’s Learning from Whom?
Harriman Core Project, 2014-15
David Stark, Director; Elena Krumova, Postdoctoral Fellow

In late 1989 and early 1990, the dominant idea among policymakers was that the countries of Eastern Europe would be learning from the West. The term transition offered an image in which East Europeans were on a road to catching up with Western institutions which had earlier arrived at the right answers for the proper models of the relationship between markets and democracies. Twenty five years later, we are organizing a project at the Harriman Institute in which our goal is to consolidate existing research – less about “1989” itself than about the past 25 years of experience with political and economic transformations. To do so, we will focus on how different actors are learning from each other. Who is paying attention to whom? And what new combinations are being cobbled together in this process?

In hindsight, the fall of the Berlin Wall marked not only the end of the communist regimes in Eastern Europe but also the end of the Cold War consensus that market and democratic institutions work in unison and with little friction. Among ordinary people in the Eastern bloc, “the West” stood for rich consumer societies with seemingly unrestricted freedom of personal expression. The communist regimes had failed to deliver on their promises for either prosperity or workers’ democracy. One of the political party posters in the first elections in Hungary in 1990 captured this sentiment well with the image of a broken fork used to scribble May 1st for the celebration of Labor Day. The symbolism was obvious – this broken tool was good neither for writing, nor for eating. The regime had to change and the model was clear – it was Western liberal democracy. Market and political institutions had to be split into two independent spheres of life. These two separate spheres, however, shared the same simple logic – the logic of competition. Lack of competition among political parties and firms during communism caused the downfall of the regime. The prescription was straightforward and simple.

This Cold War consensus has slowly unraveled in the last twenty five years and especially after the financial crisis of 2008. Today the alliance between market and democratic institutions does not seem as unproblematic as it did in 1990. The logic of competition is not enough to guarantee political voice and shared prosperity. Competition for economic resources among political rivals in the former communist countries, counter-intuitively, create interdependency among firms and parties. At least in the case of Hungary, one of the most globalized countries in Eastern Europe, this inter-dependency has only increased over time to produce a politicized economy. Moreover, discontent about globalization, the European Union, and multiculturalism has grown across Eastern Europe. As political parties on both sides have revived rhetoric from before World War II, are they also looking for ways to experiment with new models?

For example, in an important speech in July 2014, Hungarian Prime Minister Viktor Orban commended the idea of “illiberal democracy” and pointed to China and Russia as exemplars from which his country had much to learn. In this speech, Orban explicitly problematized the relationship between markets and democracy and challenged the policymaking
consensus of the last quarter century. In no place is this challenge more clearly visible than in China. If June 4, 1989 was the day of Solidarity’s electoral triumph against the communist party in Poland, it was also the very same day in which the Chinese leadership crushed the Tiananmen Square protesters. How has China subsequently paid attention to developments in Eastern Europe and the countries of the former Soviet Union? Evidence suggests that China took the fall of the Berlin Wall, the rise of dissident groups, and internal divisions within the communist parties of the region as a negative model for its own future. While Eastern Europe was importing institutions wholesale, China has invented a hybrid model that we can refer to as “Market Leninism.” This model combines market reforms with one-party control over the army, economic appointments, and ideological doctrine.

If we broaden our vision, we can see other instances of non-violent attempts to overthrow authoritarian regimes via popular uprisings in Serbia, Georgia, Ukraine, Kyrgyzstan, Lebanon, Egypt, and Tunisia. From the so-called Colored Revolutions of Eurasia, to the Jasmine Revolutions of North Africa, to the Umbrella Revolution in contemporary Hong Kong, what models of democratic and economic institutions are they paying attention to? In contrast to the Eastern Europeans, people in these regions do not necessarily look to Western liberal democracy as the logical path to be taken. Protestors are inventing new repertoires of resistance, demonstrations, and political tactics. And what lessons have authoritarian governments learned and what adaptions have they made? Our goal is to investigate these evolving processes by observing who is paying attention to whom.